

Eugene Climate Action Plan 2.0

Reduce, Reuse, Recycle Chapter Meeting

Wednesday, August 8, 2018 • 2-5 pm
Lane Community College Downtown Center, Room 303
101 W 10th Ave, Eugene, OR 97401

Present: Holly Langan, 4J School District; Deveron Musgrave, City of Eugene; Joshua Monge, Eugene Chamber of Commerce; Luis Maggiori, Lane Community College; Sarah Grimm, Lane County; Susan Blane, PeaceHealth; Greg Shabram, University of Oregon

Climate Action Plan 2.0 Project Team: Chelsea Clinton, City of Eugene; Brittany Judson, City of Eugene; Jessica Lisiewski, City of Eugene; Ethan Nelson, City of Eugene; Joshua Proudfoot, Good Company

Opening Remarks

Chelsea Clinton gave an overview of the project vision including a review of the core project commitments (Triple Bottom Line, Strategic Doing and Adding Value) and an overview of the project equity initiatives.

Introductions

Participants and community members introduced themselves and provided what they hoped to get out of the meeting or process. Common themes included connecting with each other and across organizations, learning about other endeavors and new ideas, sharing, looking to the future, partnership, best practices for reducing single occupancy vehicle travel, and mapping out our community investments.

CAP 2.0 project goals and process

Chelsea Clinton provided a more detailed overview of the CAP2.0 project including the CRO Goals, 2017 Mayor's CRO Ad Hoc Work Group, core project commitments, equity initiatives, Large Lever Shareholders, CAP2.0 project timeline, and project team.

Equity Discussion

Chelsea Clinton facilitated the discussion. The group discussed the difference between equality and equity. Then the group reviewed the project equity lens. Last, the larger group broke out into smaller groups to share their organization's equity framework.

Scope of Today's Meeting – Josh Proudfoot

Josh Proudfoot shared some facts to frame the discussion:

- 40-60 percent of our emissions in the United States comes from what we buy – the emissions that are being produced elsewhere to make the things we bring into our community.
- If it's being emitted in India, it still counts toward our carbon footprint (and is captured in our greenhouse gas inventory).
- Of these emissions: Corporate consumption accounts for 10%; Government accounts for 10%; and Households account for 80% of imported emissions.
- The emissions from disposal are negligible compared to the imported emissions.

- Emissions from new things (consuming new stuff) are much higher than the emissions from stuff made from recycled materials. So recycling has a role in reducing the consumption of virgin material.

Discussion of Best Management Practices – Facilitated by Josh Proudfoot

Josh presented some Best Management practices (page 3 of agenda).

- Definition of **high impact practices vs. important triple bottom line practices**: High impact practices have system level impacts that have a very high impact on greenhouse gas emissions. Important triple bottom line practices are climate related actions that have a variety of benefits across our community, but have a smaller impact on total greenhouse gas emissions or climate adaptation.

Additional high impact best management practices:

The group brainstormed additional best management practices, and those practices that should be reclassified as high impact practices or triple bottom line practices. Some themes discussed:

Right to Repair legislation

- Josh Proudfoot - You cannot make a product that only has a disposal pathway. Guarantee that it could be repaired by somebody. This is a common concern with IT hardware.

Product Stewardship on an industry level

- Sarah Grimm, Lane County – Is there a national law that requires manufacturers to publish how much energy is used?
- Josh Proudfoot – In cars we see that.
- Ethan Nelson, project team– At federal level, there is for appliances like EnergyStar. Are there clear targets in the household that are high carbon? Community-wide – is it low carbon foods? Appliances? Electronics? Has DEQ identified these?

Food waste reduction

- Josh Proudfoot: Food Waste is a big deal. Any time you waste a tiny bit of food the emissions are much larger than the packaging it comes in. Don't pay attention to the packaging. The packaging is a very small slice of a much longer emissions profile – most of which is upstream. It doesn't have anything to do with composting.
- Most of the energy and GHG intensity of food is in the production of food, not in the packaging, transportation, or disposal. People that compost tend to waste more food – because they don't feel as guilty about it. But the footprint upstream is bigger than the downstream benefit of feeding the soil.
- Josh Proudfoot: According to proprietary research on the food delivery packages, even with all the packaging they actually come out to help if they prevent food waste as they say they do. Compared with food waste, all the packaging and transportation comes to almost nothing in impacts.

Household-level decision making/Education

- Education might be high impact if it's done well and with the right things, such as putting time into telling people don't waste food. The problem with education is that it's hard to scale. If it's scaled at a community-wide level, then it could be a high impact practice, but that's hard to do. It is the precursor to the right behavior.

Low carbon foods

- Josh – Dairy and beef are the highest carbon foods. Lower carbon foods, which usually means more plants, and less meat. Pork and chicken are roughly half of what dairy and beef are. This is due to the upstream field emissions of corn and soy, the fertilizer that feeds the corn and soy. The cow's feed and the nutrients into that feed are where footprint lies.

Procurement – right amount and right things

- Josh Proudfoot—Bulk buy – cooperative purchase – right way and still make it affordable.

Items that should be moved to the triple bottom line practices.

- Sarah Grimm, Lane County – Landfill diversion does not attend to upstream impacts.
 - When you include the stuff that's recycled, it's to avoid the emissions from virgin extraction, not to avoid the disposal.
 - We get the language waste prevention, waste reduction and recycling mixed up. Waste reduction – it can engender both when it comes in and recycling. Waste prevention sends signals upstream, which is more impactful. Reduction is ambiguous. Food waste means things that go into compost. But wasted food, that means food that could have been reused.

Additional high impact adaptation best management practices

- Joshua Monge, Chamber of Commerce- The Saturday market and consumption habits of marginalized people – giving them more options that are carbon friendly with their limitations.
 - Josh Proudfoot, project team– people w/lower incomes have less options for food. Usually fast food becomes part of the regular diet (high carbon). Saturday market is not accessible to all. And the food consumption habits of marginalized people are different than wealthier folks.
- Josh Proudfoot, project team: More food buying systems tailored to the neighborhood – wealthier neighborhoods have more demand for vegetarian/vegan – poorer neighborhoods tend to prefer meat/dairy.

Actions of Each Organization - Facilitated by Josh Proudfoot

Josh Proudfoot asked each participant to identify actions that are underway or forthcoming on this topic, either within their own organizations or in support of households to move people toward lower carbon foods, more durability, more recycled or used goods.

Ethan Nelson, project team emphasized that for some organizations, the educational aspects might be more impactful than procurement within organization.

University of Oregon – Greg Shabram

Actions

- Enterprise management system with a single vendor. It's going to save university a lot of money.
- All reconstructed toner - no inkjets on campus (inkjets on campus are 9-10 times the waste as toner or laser jet). The per page cost less than 1 cent per click.
- We'll have a centralized tracking of all pages printed on campus with networking of printing. We'll be able to see what departments are cranking out the paper, and then go work with them to reduce their paper.
 - Joshua Monge, Eugene Chamber of Commerce – Is there a high upfront cost to make that switch?
 - Greg Shabram - Not with the contract that we negotiated. We leveraged UO size and buying power. The contract is from 2021-2023 – in exchange for being the single source for management services – they are providing us with the new printers. No upfront cost. Expend some of the savings on being more sustainable. The printers are owned by U of O.
 - Essentially displacing the need for making new toner cartridges. HP – they only do newly manufactured toner, which is why they didn't get the contract.

Lane County – Sarah Grimm

Actions

- Lane County set a goal to for recovery rate. We intend to increase amount that is recycled in Lane Community, targeting new materials like asphalt or gypsum, sector by sector. We're rolling out resources for business/commercial recycling (free resources) – will help encourage people to recycle more.
- We support repair and fix-it fairs.
- We provide technical assistance to the repair and reuse community and provide public resources pointing people to where they can get things repaired.
- We support reuse and sharing to businesses such as Next Step and MECCA.
- On the draft solid waste masterplan, we support product stewardship efforts (signed onto effort to get a product stewardship bill around pharmaceuticals). This holds industry accountable for recovery or reducing the impacts of their product. This has not been approved yet by board of commissioners.
- We provide assistance to schools – recycling education programs to go out into the schools. We fund Bring Recycling to go into schools. They do more actual activities and facilitation of events – such as the share fair for families – something that facilitates sharing and reusing/swapping to avoid purchase of new goods.
- Grants for schools to join Oregon Green Schools.
- Implement a new recycling requirement for recycling and demolition loads within certain cubic yards.
- Contracting with BRING recycling with Cans On program (emphasis on recycling), which comes with toolkit and instructions, working hands on with at least ten companies this year. Lane County helps people get connected to these opportunities.
- Citizen training Master Recycling Program, which gives the participants a full perspective on these issues. It also provides an additional workforce to educate and facilitate Reduce, Reuse,

Recycle. Master Recyclers who go through training commit to 30 hours of volunteer work on 3Rs throughout community.

- One master recycler led project worked with the napkin/restaurant supply company - they throw away a lot of napkins. They distributed 8,000 cloth napkins to churches and organizations that will replace paper napkins.
- Durable dishware for events- gets a lot of use.

Eugene Chamber of Commerce – Joshua Monge

Actions

- Encourage staff to use PeaceHealth Rides bike share.
- Emerald Valley High Performance Enterprise Consortium – Lean process and Lean manufacturing – helps businesses that are committed to process improvement with reduction of waste generally defined.
- While not a program, we are finding that more businesses are looking for ways to engage in triple bottom line processes and more are adopting.

Discussion

Josh Proudfoot asked if anyone was working on or seeing activity to get more durable, repairable, recycled content, used content, or green manufactured products?

- Greg Shabram –UO reuses furniture; working on downcycling existing furniture within the university, and less of it is going into warehouse space.
- We have an office supply reuse closet
 - We should have software for this. It would be a more modern way of operating it.

PeaceHealth – Susan Blane

Actions

- More online meetings and presenting documentation online.
- We're moving to more centralized ordering, with a limited the set of what can be ordered. When it's all ordered through one company (both office supply and medical supplies) it sets pathways so they're ordering the same equipment for all hospitals by predicting need. This will reduce waste.
- On the food side – we encourage people to adopt plant based diets. We offer trainings.
- In food purchasing we're moving toward weight based purchases so we order the right amount.
- We're changing shifts. Considering free or low-cost LTD passes. Come to work and drive less while still working longer shifts.

Discussion

Greg Shabram - Sees opportunities to do cooperative purchasing: Everyone buys janitorial and sanitation products. We can leverage savings to get premiums for sustainable products. If that happened across multiple organizations, it would be even more effective.

4J School District – Holly Langan

Actions/Barriers

- We're discussing right now whether centralized purchasing or more decentralized purchasing makes more sense. Right now, we have one central warehouse. A truckload of paper goes into

the bays, then it goes out to schools. Surplus property has turned into a storage place and is difficult to manage. If all the schools had a direct shipment of paper and we didn't have a central paper supply, it would free up warehouse space to better manage the property available. We're not sure which has more value.

- Greg Shabram, University of Oregon mentioned that NASPO contract for office depot/max Aspen 30 – best price for recycled content. Find savings by doing that.
- Greg Shabram, University of Oregon – Is it better to have customer's handle the last mile? Maybe you're delivering it in a more sustainable way by doing that. In higher education, universities are driving toward central store, but it really comes down to how valuable campus space is. Space is a premium here, so we don't have the infrastructure. If you invest in less infrastructure, you might lose advantageous capabilities in the future.

Discussion

Ethan Nelson, project team mentioned that a few years back, there was a sustainable procurement group for public agencies – city U of O Lane County. Do they still meet?

- Greg Shabram, University of Oregon - CADE would be a good vehicle for that.

Josh Proudfoot, project team - More durable products are more expensive, but buying in bulk is where you get the benefit. Furniture is a big issue – St Vinny's is taking torn upholstery and repairing it.

Deveron Musgrave, City of Eugene—Regarding the reuse market, there's an issue with space is a constraint. Most reuse orgs have a surplus of everything that we're donating to them, because we're donating too much. We need to make sure we're reusing it rather than just donating.

City of Eugene – Deveron Musgrave

Actions

- With paper – there are digital solutions for most applications.
- Environmentally preferred purchasing.
- City of Eugene began a construction and Demolition reuse pilot.
- Repair cafes – with a Spanish language repair café planned for next year.
- Working through district educators to provide schools education around waste prevention.
- Residential food waste collection – roll out this year. Curbside at single family residents.
 - Curbside collection at residences. Won't capture multifamily, but will single family residents. That will in theory happen before end of the year.

Josh Proudfoot – Are there any right sizing efforts? Procurement talking to users about overbuying stuff? We commonly see that in fleet. Are there other asset categories lend themselves to that kind of thinking?

City of Eugene, Deveron Musgrave

Actions

- Right tool is used by many interdepartmentally. It looks different depending on the department.

University of Oregon – Greg Shabram

Actions

- IT hardware suppliers to have UO standard configurations to have low power supply options. Many UO employees use computers mainly for word processing. In applying low power hardware, there's an immense savings in power usage. Reduce energy use of the hardware.
- If the low power supply is left running and not put to sleep, a lot of power is still wasted. We're trying to get enterprise-management of resources. They have pieces of software that administer the settings of those machines - it's software that is set up to have a common image which forces a machine to shut off.

4J School District - Holly Langan

Actions/Barriers

- We're making a lot of choices around student meal service, which is the nexus of social equity.
 - There are different community demands around what parents expect their kids to eat.
 - A plant based diet may not align with school districts mission to honor different needs and values.
 - Food service has been challenging in terms of community desire to move to more sustainable local foods that don't always meet the expectation of some families.
- Food service – Tradeoff in values, with food waste being such a large component.
 - USDA requirement, in order for them to be reimbursed for a meal, they have to serve particular meal components based on USDA. We can't change that. It has to be served to the students who may not want it. This creates a lot of food waste. After it's been served, it can't be re-served.
 - One idea after that meeting is to change the way someone is offering an item. If it was wrapped up in plastic packaging, it might be put in a "no, thank you" box. However, that packaging is non-recyclable so it creates its own waste issues.
 - Love Food Not Waste in schools.

Consumption and Equity Discussion

Josh Proudfoot, project team – The smaller the dwelling, the less a household consumes. Accessory dwelling units support a lower carbon footprint.

Ethan Nelson, project team – The City of Portland did a study looking at consumption and income levels, and found that consumption is directly tied to income level. People at a higher income level have a much bigger carbon footprint. People with available means tend to spend more money. If it's not just stuff, it's also travel and other forms of carbon footprint. There's causation and then impact.

Ethan Nelson, project team – Changing the narrative around this is the end goal. However, this is all more nuanced. Even though vegetarian vs. meat based protein is better, but still higher income households consume more and have larger carbon footprints. We should not have a discussion that shames people that choose to eat that way.

Josh Proudfoot, project team – There's an opportunity to educate folks with more money to get them to reduce their consumption. The education effort must be focused on them. In certain neighborhoods,

you're going to be vegetarian/vegan. In other neighborhoods, dairy/meat. Moving up in consumption and status, it's all linked. The more that is earned, the more that is used and emitted.

Josh Proudfoot, project team – A long term solution would be to change the narrative. For example, smoking: it used to be considered a “right” but it affects everyone else. The narrative has now completely changed, and the effects on others are considered.

Joshua Monge, Chamber of Commerce – There was an economist that suggested is the problems is savings. We currently spend more than we make and have debt. If we saved a bigger percentage, that would even things out quite a bit.

Ethan Nelson, project team - DEQ did a project setting up 2050 vision for the state. The vision was around livability and quality of life. Many of our consumption habits are antithetical to actual quality of life. For example cars - are we going to get away from cars? Cars are status symbols that don't contribute to quality of life, but have a direct impact on emissions. How as a community can we coordinate a campaign over the course of decades to rebrand?

Future Climate Conditions in Eugene – presented by Josh Proudfoot

Josh Proudfoot presented on the Future Climate Conditions whitepaper - what we can expect the future conditions in Eugene to be in the next 30 – 100 years from climate change. Some key anticipated changes included:

- Increase population - Increased economic activity in Oregon with decrease in the South and Midwest.
- Hotter and drier summers 10-12 degrees Fahrenheit warmer by 2100.
- Warmer winters with the same amount of precipitation, but less snow/more rain. Snowpack in Cascades nearly gone by 2040.
- Increased wildfires – 500-600 percent more surface area by 2040.
- Halved summer stream flows by 2040.
- Increased economic activity in the Northwest.

Discussion of impacts – facilitated by Josh Proudfoot

Josh Proudfoot - How will the waste and recycling systems be affected by dry season changes? Any research from COE, Lane County, or LCC?

- Ethan Nelson, project team – Most noticeable impact of increased heat will be, as we implement organic collection, there may be public health impacts and disease vectors. More putrescent material into waste system that is then in denser setting. Increased in collection costs. Odor.
- Sarah Grimm, Lane County – Population change might need to be considered further in the landfill planning. Engineers calculate the life of the landfill to 160 years. But I don't know what kind of population increase was factored in. Collection systems will need to be tightened down, especially in rural areas. Since more people may go to rural areas when they can't really fit into COE. Don't see as being a huge burden as it'll probably grow organically and slowly.
- Joshua Monge, Chamber of Commerce – We might see more air conditioners in the waste stream, and more refrigerant use in the area.

- Deveron Musgrave – You can recycle refrigerant. Market forces would end up factoring in.
- Josh Proudfoot – There will be a lot more refrigerant use in the area. Montreal has international accord on phasing out of certain refrigerants and replacements, but that doesn't mean refrigerants aren't leaking.

Josh Proudfoot, project team - Would the heat affect the landfill? Methane production will increase with the warmth. Can be capped and pulled, but the scale might exceed the current system.

- Sarah Grimm, Lane County: We have never made enough to use all four of the generators. Emphasize more repair and reuse. But it's operated by EPUD, not by Lane County.

Josh Proudfoot, project team: How will the waste and recycling systems be affected by wet season changes?

- Sarah Grimm, Lane County – We have an aggressive management system for leachate. We have high leachate flow occurrences already. We recently built a new storage tank. The current system is to pump it into trucks and drive it to access port and wastewater treatment facilities. In the future, we would like to have a pipeline to prevent truck travel.

Josh Proudfoot: Will it affect the creek? And will increased rain become a problem for moving or hauling?

- Sarah Grimm – Depends on community to develop, adapt, and have roads maintained.

Joshua Monge, Eugene Chamber of Commerce – We're seeing rainfall extremes in real time. We will see more flooding. Josh Proudfoot – What about landfills and soil stability?

- Sarah Grimm, Lane County – It's engineered to accommodate and prevent such things. The cover the area of landfill not slated to be used or is not being used. There's a minimum amount of exposed area that would be subject to that.

Are there systems to handle large volumes of debris at once?

- Sarah Grimm, Lane County - We have a cohesive disaster management system for the landfill.
- Ethan Nelson, project team – The disaster debris management annex is updated to FEMA standards.
- Sarah Grimm, Lane County - It's engineered to accommodate and prevent landslides.

Equity Lens and Discussion – facilitated by Brittany Judson

Brittany gave everyone time to read the equity lens, and then had people break out in groups to discuss what the equity lens brought up in relation to their work and actions. The group then reconvened and shared elements of their small group discussions.

Sarah Grimm, Lane County: Regarding population increase and how it impacts access to food and cultural differences. How can we encourage more local grocery stores that cater to these populations?

- Joshua Monge, Chamber of Commerce: We are at a saturation point for grocery stores. Market is oversaturated.

Ethan Nelson, project team - There will be a price impact on food. Climate change will impact crops globally, which will have equity impacts with regard to food costs.

Deveron Musgrave, City of Eugene - Regarding the construction and demolition materials reuse program – while it's important it may have increased cost impacts. Time equals increased cost when it comes to housing.

Luis Maggiori, Lane Community College - LCC part of Love Food Not Waste program – additionally leftover food is picked up and given as donation. For lower carbon food items, campaign meatless Monday. We incentivize meatless items at lower cost, explain education benefit and health benefit, financial impact.

Key Takeaways and Next Steps – Facilitated by Ethan Nelson

Everyone shared what they learned or took away from the meeting today.

Takeaways from today's discussion: Lever should be utilized around food waste prevention and low carbon foods. Americans waste 40% of food. CADE is a good way to get to sustainable procurement. Heartened that we're all doing something in our institutions. Offer broad enough food offering that is respectful of values. Support district plant based choices – without equity impacts? Opportunities for education and past successes with recycling – how to translate that to consumption in future. Took 15 years – and worked at from all angles. Success with messaging on – buy what you need at the right amount and right time. Mass behavior change in the households- no one wants to hear that from governments.

Next steps: The City of Eugene will follow up on information you gave today.